

# Contract Amendment #1 with Baker Tilly for Analysis of Fleet Funding and Maintenance should not be a priority

First as a priority project associated with Dante leaving, I thought the water and sewer infrastructure inventory would be the priority. After years of misappropriating money from rate payers to fund general services, it seemed we were turning a corner and beginning to prioritize water and sewer.

Instead, the critical nature of a vehicle replacement study has popped up. One could question both the critical nature of the work and the cost of the study.

First, there is a vehicle and equipment replacement plan that was published in the previous year's budgets but left out of this year's budget for some reason. It had spreadsheet errors as is common with city documents, but they are easily fixed.

It appears to be a complete list of vehicles and equipment, although I see a prius with police markings near my home that is not listed. We don't really have to pay a consultant to put vehicles in the spreadsheet. It would be a 15-minute task for department heads to check the list. It would be the same 15 minutes they would spend when Baker Tilly asks.

The simple task of adding a 4% inflation assumption for the future creates meaningful numbers for future cost replacement and we have a working model that is also the deliverable from Baker Tilly. So far, I have spent about an hour recreating the spreadsheet and making it useful. The print is small here, but you have the original in the 23-24 budget document.

CITY VEHICLES LIST

Asset Inventory					Status of My Assets?		Which Are Most 'Critical'?				Renewal / Replacement Strategy			
Asset Register and Hierarchy	Control Department	Year Installed	Original Cost	Effective Life	Original Planned Replacement Year	Wage / Hours	Estimated Replacement	Probability of Failure	Consequence of Failure	BRE Rating	Renewal / Replacement Strategy	Cost of Renewal / Replacement Option	Recommended Renewal / Replacement Year	Future Value of Renewal / Replacement Cost
1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10	11	12	13	14	15
Labels		2	3	4	5	%	Estimated	%	Estimated	Estimated	Estimated	Estimated	Estimated	Estimated
0010 - 2017 Ford C-Max Hybrid	Public Works	2017	\$33,000	15	2032	43,665	30%	-43,639	7	-52,807	Status Quo	\$47,806	2032	\$47,806
0011 - 2016 Ford F250 w/Service Utility Body	Public Works	2016	\$96,000	15	2031	14,520	30%	-14,512	7	-50,792	Status Quo	\$40,322	2031	\$40,322
0012 - 2016 Ford F350 w/Flat Bed	Public Works	2016	\$58,200	15	2031	42,200	30%	-42,244	7	-147,254	Status Quo	\$33,991	2031	\$33,991
0014 - 2014 Ford F-250 w/Flat Bed	Public Works	2014	\$74,114	15	2029	31,158	30%	-31,112	7	-79,892	Status Quo	\$109,731	2029	\$109,731
0015 - 2014 Ford F250 w/Service Utility Body	Public Works	2014	\$32,700	15	2029	16,297	30%	-16,291	7	-127,519	Status Quo	\$42,500	2029	\$42,500
0016 - 2012 Ford F150	Public Works	2012	\$36,048	15	2027	1,270	30%	-1,264	7	-4,424	Status Quo	\$24,000	2027	\$24,000
0017 - 2014 Ford F250 w/Service Utility Body	Public Works	2014	\$32,892	15	2029	42,211	30%	-42,209	7	-147,718	Status Quo	\$44,400	2029	\$44,400
0018 - 2017 Ford F250 w/Service Utility Body	Public Works	2017	\$34,000	15	2032	10,000	30%	-10,000	7	-66,707	Status Quo	\$38,400	2032	\$38,400
0019 - 2014 Ford F250 w/Service Utility Body	Public Works	2014	\$37,499	15	2029	32,713	30%	-32,707	7	-114,479	Status Quo	\$20,000	2029	\$20,000
0020 - 2016 Ford F250 w/Service Utility Body	Public Works	2016	\$77,000	20	2036	1,024	30%	-1,024	7	-6,337	Status Quo	\$61,600	2036	\$61,600
0021 - 2006 Chevrolet Pickup	Public Works	2006	\$14,000	13	2011	68,182	30%	-68,174	7	-238,616	Status Quo	\$38,500	2011	\$38,500
0022 - 2010 Ford F250 w/Service Utility Body	Public Works	2010	\$74,184	20	2030	10,483	30%	-10,477	7	-47,470	Status Quo	\$118,000	2030	\$118,000
0023 - 2018 Ford F250 w/Service Utility Body	Public Works	2018	\$36,000	15	2033	20,611	30%	-20,609	7	-71,618	Status Quo	\$40,322	2033	\$40,322
0024 - 2012 Chevrolet Colorado Pickup	Public Works	2012	\$28,343	15	2017	1,121	30%	-1,117	7	-10,909	Status Quo	\$24,500	2017	\$24,500
0025 - 2017 Ford F250 w/Service Utility Body	Public Works	2017	\$24,000	15	2032	21,108	30%	-21,100	7	-108,559	Status Quo	\$39,400	2032	\$39,400
0027 - 2011 Ford F150 Pickup	Public Works	2011	\$31,149	15	2016	3,206	30%	-3,200	7	-11,200	Status Quo	\$24,500	2016	\$24,500
0028 - 2011 Ford F150 Pickup	Public Works	2011	\$29,894	15	2016	3,242	30%	-3,236	7	-11,238	Status Quo	\$28,500	2016	\$28,500
0030 - 2018 Ford Explorer	Police	2018	\$45,000	20	2037	8,900	30%	-8,764	6	-66,146	Status Quo	\$20,000	2037	\$20,000
0033 - 2005 Harley Davidson Motorcycle	Police	2005	\$20,000	20	2025	40,211	30%	-40,203	7	-140,718	Status Quo	\$36,000	2025	\$36,000
0034 - 2005 Harley Davidson Motorcycle	Police	2005	\$20,000	20	2025	42,766	30%	-42,760	7	-160,140	Status Quo	\$36,000	2025	\$36,000
0035 - 2018 Ford Escape	Police	2018	\$27,000	10	2027	8,511	30%	-8,503	6	-76,543	Status Quo	\$20,000	2027	\$20,000
0037 - 2017 Ford Fusion	Police	2017	\$40,000	10	2027	21,173	30%	-21,147	7	-74,089	Status Quo	\$35,000	2027	\$35,000
0038 - 2018 Ford Fusion	Police	2018	\$40,000	10	2028	18,023	30%	-18,799	7	-65,790	Status Quo	\$20,000	2028	\$20,000
0041 - 2017 Ford Explorer	Police	2017	\$47,000	10	2027	31,803	30%	-31,797	7	-181,290	Status Quo	\$33,400	2027	\$33,400
0042 - 2018 Ford Explorer	Police	2018	\$46,750	10	2027	31,342	30%	-31,336	7	-179,176	Status Quo	\$20,000	2027	\$20,000
0043 - 2017 Ford Explorer	Police	2017	\$47,000	10	2027	26,307	30%	-26,301	7	-92,054	Status Quo	\$23,400	2027	\$23,400
0044 - 2014 Ford Explorer	Police	2014	\$46,750	10	2026	69,918	30%	-69,912	7	-233,692	Status Quo	\$11,500	2026	\$11,500
0048 - 1995 Mighty Mover D/U Trailer	Public Works	1995	\$12,000	40	2038	N/A	N/A	N/A	7	N/A	Status Quo	\$10,000	2038	\$10,000
0049 - 2014 Ford Explorer	Police	2014	\$28,100	10	2024	69,343	30%	-69,339	7	-242,867	Status Quo	\$20,000	2024	\$20,000
0050 - 2014 Ford Explorer	Police	2014	\$28,100	10	2024	69,304	30%	-69,318	7	-114,718	Status Quo	\$20,000	2024	\$20,000
0052 - 2005 Ford Escape/Hybrid	Police	2005	\$27,100	14	2019	77,725	30%	-77,722	7	-272,132	Status Quo	\$42,500	2019	\$42,500
0060 - 1999 Honda ATV	Public Works	1999	\$5,000	20	2019	N/A	N/A	N/A	7	N/A	Status Quo	\$7,500	2019	\$7,500
0070 - 2001 Featherlite Trailer	Public Works	2001	\$20,000	20	2021	N/A	N/A	N/A	7	N/A	Status Quo	\$4,000	2021	\$4,000
0071 - 2009 Featherlite Trailer	Public Works	2009	\$3,343	20	2019	N/A	N/A	N/A	7	N/A	Status Quo	\$4,500	2019	\$4,500
0072 - 2014 P Manufacturing Tool Off Trailer	Public Works	2014	\$12,000	20	2034	N/A	N/A	N/A	7	N/A	Status Quo	\$3,000	2034	\$3,000
0073 - 2009 Chevy Silverado Trailer	Public Works	2009	\$9,000	20	2029	N/A	N/A	N/A	7	N/A	Status Quo	\$5,000	2029	\$5,000
0080 CAT 920B&M Standby Generator	Public Works	2000	\$60,000	20	2020	18,993	30%	-18,993	7	N/A	Status Quo	\$0	2020	\$0
0083 - 1996 Almond Air Compressor Trailer	Public Works	1996	\$10,000	20	2016	30,646	30%	-30,646	7	N/A	Status Quo	\$16,500	2016	\$16,500
0087 - 2002 John Deere 310E Backhoe	Public Works	2002	\$39,900	20	2022	266.8 Hrs.	30%	N/A	7	N/A	Status Quo	\$25,000	2022	\$25,000
0088 - 2002 Case 710 N/C Loader/Tractor	Public Works	2002	\$36,980	20	2022	86.9 Hrs.	30%	N/A	7	N/A	Status Quo	\$0	2022	\$0
0089 - 2012 John Deere 310E Backhoe	Public Works	2012	\$39,477	20	2032	648.0 Hrs.	30%	N/A	7	N/A	Status Quo	\$160,000	2032	\$160,000
0095 - 2009 International/Vactor Truck Model 1103	Public Works	2009	\$147,761	15	2024	24,240	30%	-24,234	7	-84,889	Status Quo	\$147,000	2024	\$147,000
0097 - 2017 International/Vactor Truck Model 1103	Public Works	2017	\$237,000	15	2032	8,688	30%	-8,680	7	-93,110	Status Quo	\$147,000	2032	\$147,000
0300 - 2014 Ford Explorer	Fire	2014	\$10,000	15	2023	6,844	30%	-6,838	7	N/A	Status Quo	\$20,000	2023	\$20,000
0883 - 2015 Chevrolet Tahoe	Fire	2015	\$40,000	10	2025	10,384	30%	-10,378	7	-44,333	Status Quo	\$49,600	2025	\$49,600
0300 - 1994 International Emergency Response	Fire	1994	\$100,000	23	2017	24,828	30%	-24,827	7	-94,000	Status Quo	\$20,000	2017	\$20,000
0340 - 2008 Dodge Ram 2500 Pickup	Fire	2008	\$33,500	20	2028	33,340	30%	-33,334	7	-158,469	Status Quo	\$40,000	2028	\$40,000
0343 - 2014 Kenworth T8 Truck	Fire	2014	\$10,000	10	2024	N/A	N/A	N/A	7	N/A	Status Quo	\$10,000	2024	\$10,000
0350 - 2003 Pierce Dash Fire Ladder Truck	Fire	2003	\$396,000	20	2023	17,890	30%	-17,884	7	-62,294	Status Quo	\$1,500,000	2023	\$1,500,000
0361 - 1996 International Fire Engine Type 3	Fire	1996	\$11,000	25	2021	126,629	30%	-126,619	7	-449,167	Status Quo	\$40,000	2021	\$40,000
0380 - 2014 Pierce Velocity Fire Engine	Fire	2014	\$495,000	20	2034	27,924	30%	-27,945	7	-97,100	Status Quo	\$290,000	2034	\$290,000
0381 - 1990 Pierce Lance Fire Engine	Fire	1990	\$220,000	30	2020	41,304	30%	-41,298	7	-144,743	Status Quo	\$90,000	2020	\$90,000
Grand Total:			\$2,564,237									\$4,793,217		\$4,793,217

Extended Time

Summary

The fact it is coming up at this meeting presumes the study is critical, but when you look at the departments it is clear that there are no immediate critical issues with vehicles replacement for the next 3-5 years and refunding the vehicle/equipment replacement fund is trivial in the context of the overall budget. There are legitimate questions about how many vehicles are needed in public works and the police inventory. The fire equipment replacement strategy is really better suited to Gold Ridge but we can look and see if there are critical issues.

## FIRE

First, we look at the fire department. Equipment replacement has been an issue with recent councils, but with the decision to replace the Type 3 in 2022 and the type 1 in 2024 it looks like the most critical items have been funded. There is an aging ladder truck, but it is unclear how often it is being used. Following the plan below there are essentially two pickup trucks that are scheduled for replacement in the next three years and neither has more than 50,000 miles, which is not a lot for modern vehicles.

CITY VEHICLES LIST																			
Asset Register and Hierarchy		Control Department	Year Installed	Original Cost	Effective Life	Milage / Hours	Original Planned Replacement Year	Cost of Renewal / Replacement Option	Future Value of Renewal / Replacement Cost	Recomm ended Renewal / until Replacement Year	Years until replacement	Past replacement	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029	2030	2031
Levels			\$	Years			Current Value	Inflation Rate			2024 date								
1 2 3 4 5							Calculated Estimate	4%	\$0										
12	8300 - 2018 Ford Explorer	Fire	2018	\$30,000	15	6,844	2033	\$50,000	\$50,000										
13	0583 - 2015 Chevrolet Tahoe	Fire	2015	\$40,000	10	18,384	2025	\$69,605	\$72,389	2025	1		\$ 72,389						
14	8330 - 1994 International Emergency Response	Fire	1994	\$100,000	23	28,853	2017	\$350,000	\$350,000	2017	0	\$ 350,000							
15	8340 - 2008 Dodge Ram 2500 Pickup	Fire	2008	\$33,500	20	53,340	2028	\$60,000	\$70,192	2028	4			\$ 70,192					
16	8343 - 2014 Klamath 13' Rescue Boat	Fire	2014	\$3,800	10	N/A	2024	\$10,000	\$10,000	2024	0	\$ 10,000							
17	8350 - 2003 Pierce Dash Fire Ladder Truck	Fire	2003	\$596,000	20	17,890	2023	\$1,500,000	\$1,500,000	2023	0	\$ 1,500,000							
18	8361 - 1996 International Fire Engine Type 3	Fire	1996	\$12,000	25	126,625	2046	\$450,000	\$1,066,463	2046	22								
19	8380 - 2011 Pierce Velocity Fire Engine	Fire	2011	\$695,500	20	27,951	2031	\$950,000	\$1,250,135	2031	7								\$1,250,135
10	8381 - 1990 Pierce Lance Fire Engine	Fire	1990	\$200,000	30	41,304	2054	\$950,000	\$3,081,228	2054	30								
	Fire Grand Total											\$ 1,860,000	\$ 72,389	\$ 70,192					\$1,250,135

## POLICE

Police equipment replacement is imminent according to the plan below. With the exception of a trailer all of the vehicles are scheduled to be replaced in the next three years. The first question that Baker Tilly cannot answer is how many vehicles do we need? What do we do with two Motorcycles. Do they need to be replaced? We field two officers a shift and presumably a Sergeant, a Captain and the Chief may all need to be out at the same time. 11 motor vehicles and 2 motorcycles seem excessive. Perhaps some vehicles are legacies that were never sold off? The department needs to develop a rationale for what equipment is critical and needs to be replaced and what is in reserve and can continue to age. Baker Tilly cannot make these decisions.

Regardless this is not a critical problem. Assuming the replacements are costed correctly, there is funding in the Vehicle Replacement fund to pay for all of the identified replacements in the next three years. It will not contribute to our fiscal emergency unless there are other needs that would go unfunded and Public Works has the most vehicles in the city. We will look at those next.

CITY VEHICLES LIST																					
Asset Register and Hierarchy		Control Department	Year Installed	Original Cost	Effective Life	Milage / Hours	Original Planned Replacement Year	Cost of Renewal / Replacement Option	Future Value of Renewal / Replacement Cost	Recomm ended Renewal / Replacement Year	Years until replacement										
Levels				\$	Years			Current Value	Inflation Rate			Past replacement date	2025	2026	2027	2028					
1	2	3	4	Calculated Estimate				4%													
18	0030 - 2019 Ford Explorer	Police	2019	\$49,000	20	9,600	2025		\$0	2025	1		\$ -								
	0033 - 2005 Harley Davidson Motorcycle	Police	2005	\$20,000	20	40,211	2025	\$36,000	\$37,440	2025	1		\$ 37,440								
	0034 - 2005 Harley Davidson Motorcycle	Police	2005	\$20,000	20	45,766	2025	\$36,000	\$37,440	2025	1		\$ 37,440								
19	0035 - 2019 Ford Escape	Police	2019	\$27,000	10	8,511	2027		\$0	2027	3										
20	0037 - 2017 Ford Fusion	Police	2017	\$40,000	10	21,173	2027	\$55,000	\$61,868	2027	3							\$ 61,868	\$ 64,342		
21	0038 - 2018 Ford Fusion	Police	2018	\$40,000	10	18,803	2028	\$55,000	\$64,342	2028	4										
22	0041 - 2017 Ford Explorer	Police	2017	\$47,000	10	51,803	2027	\$53,400	\$60,068	2027	3								\$ 60,068		
23	0042 - 2015 Ford Explorer Interceptor	Police	2015	\$46,750	10	51,342	2025	\$50,400	\$62,416	2025	1		\$ 52,416								
24	0043 - 2017 Ford Explorer	Police	2017	\$47,000	10	26,307	2027	\$53,400	\$60,068	2027	3								\$ 60,068		
25	0044 - 2016 Ford Explorer	Police	2016	\$46,750	10	63,918	2026	\$51,500	\$55,702	2026	2			\$ 55,702							
	0048 - 1998 Mighty Mover DUI Trailer	Police	1998	\$15,000	40	N/A	2038	\$30,000	\$51,950	2038	14										
26	0049 - 2014 Ford Explorer	Police	2014	\$28,100	10	69,345	2024	\$50,500	\$54,621	2024	2		\$ 54,621								
27	0050 - 2014 Ford Explorer	Police	2014	\$28,100	10	89,924	2024	\$50,500	\$54,621	2024	2		\$ 54,621								
28	0052 - 2005 Ford Escape/Hybrid	Police	2005	\$27,100	14	77,758	2019	\$42,500	\$34,932	2019	-5		\$ 34,932								
Police Grand Total									\$0				\$ 271,470	\$ 55,702	\$ 182,003	\$ 64,342					

## PUBLIC WORKS

Public Works has the most vehicles and the most equipment in the city. Looking out for 10 years the replacements are well spaced, and the costs might just be absorbed into the budgeted expense as they come up. Funding a reserve for replacement costs annually would require only about \$150,000 added to the vehicle replacement fund each year. These numbers don't include the sale value of surplus equipment so the actual costs would be less unless inflation is more than 4%. There is the fundamental question that public works has 13 FTEs and 13 vehicles that could transport or be used as utility vehicles. Do most public works employees take a vehicle to the job. Do they work individually? These are not Baker Tilly Questions.

CITY VEHICLES LIST																							
Asset Register and Hierarchy		Control Department	Year Installed	Original Cost	Effective Life	Milage / Hours	Original Planned Replacement Year	Cost of Renewal / Replacement Option	Future Value of Renewal / Replacement Cost	Recomm ended Renewal / Replacement Year	Years until replacement												
Levels				\$	Years			Current Value	Inflation Rate			2025	2026	2027	2028	2029	2030	2031	2032	2033	2034		
1	2	3	4	Calculated Estimate				4%															
0010	- 2017 Ford C-Max Hybrid	(Public V	2017	\$35,000	15	43,665	2032	\$47,606	\$65,152	2032											\$ 65,152		
0016	- 2022 Ford F150 Pickup	F Public V	2022	\$36,048	15	1,270	2037	\$24,000	\$39,962	2037													
0021	- 2008 Chevrolet Pickup	F Public V	2006	\$14,000	15	68,182	2021	\$38,500	\$41,642	2021		\$ 41,642											
0024	- 2022 Chevrolet Colorado Pickup	F Public V	2022	\$28,363	15	3,121	2037	\$24,500	\$40,794	2037													
0012	- 2016 Ford 350 4x4 Pickup	F Public V	2016	\$36,203	15	42,250	2031	\$53,591	\$70,522	2031												\$ 70,522	
0027	- 2021 Ford F150 Pickup	F Public V	2002	\$31,189	15	3,206	2036	\$24,500	\$39,225	2036													
0028	- 2021 Ford F150 Pickup	F Public V	2021	\$29,694	15	3,242	2036	\$38,500	\$61,640	2036													
0011	- 2019 Ford F250 W/Scelzi Utility Body	(Public V	2019	\$36,000	15	14,518	2034	\$40,322	\$59,686	2034												\$ 59,686	
0015	- 2014 Ford 250 w/Scelzi Utility Body	(Public V	2014	\$32,700	15	36,297	2029	\$42,500	\$51,708	2029			\$ 51,708										
0017	- 2014 Ford 250 w/Scelzi Utility Body	(Public V	2014	\$32,692	15	42,211	2029	\$44,400	\$54,019	2029			\$ 54,019										
0018	- 2017 Ford F250 w/Scelzi Utility Body	(Public V	2017	\$34,000	15	19,065	2032	\$39,400	\$53,922	2032												\$ 53,922	
0023	- 2019 Ford F250 W/Scelzi Utility Body	(Public V	2020	\$36,000	15	20,411	2035	\$40,322	\$62,074	2035												\$ 53,922	
0025	- 2017 Ford F250 w/Scelzi Utility Body	(Public V	2017	\$34,000	15	31,136	2032	\$39,400	\$53,922	2032													
0014	- 2014 Ford F-350 w/ lift	(Public V	2014	\$74,114	15	21,118	2029	\$109,731	\$133,505	2029			\$ 133,505										
0019	- 2014 Ford F350 w/Dump Body	(Public V	2014	\$37,499	15	32,713	2029	\$50,000	\$60,833	2029			\$ 60,833										
0020	- 2019 Ford F650 5 Yard Dump	(Public V	2019	\$77,000	20	1,816	2039	\$81,650	\$147,047	2039													
0022	- 2010 Ford F650 5 Yard Dump	(Public V	2010	\$74,184	20	13,483	2030	\$119,000	\$150,573	2030												\$ 150,573	
Public Works Vehicles												\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 300,064	\$ 150,573	\$ 70,522	\$ 107,843				

Public works equipment has some substantial cost items. The purpose and priority of an ATV replacement needs to be discussed by staff. Baker Tilly can't help. Replacing a Featherlite trailer given the lack of wear items seems excessive. Replace the tires and the bearings as needed.

The Vactor Truck is expensive and cleaning leaves from storm drains is important. It is unclear if they have gotten the expected wear given, we have a limited number of storm drains with leaves in our 1.2 square mile city. Again, an issue for staff to debate and decide. You don't have to pay Baker Tilly \$18,900 to facilitate, do you?

CITY VEHICLES LIST																			
Asset Register and Hierarchy										1	2	3	4	5	6	7	8	9	10
Control Department	Year Installed	Original Cost	Effective Life	Milage / Hours	Original Replacement Year	Cost of Renewal / Replacement Option	Future Value of Renewal / Replacement Cost												
Levels		\$	Years		Calculated Estimate	Current Value	Inflation Rate	2025	2026	2027	2028	2029	2030	2031	2032	2033	2034		
1 2 3 4 5							4%												
0060 - 1999 Honda ATV	Public V	1999	\$5,000	20 N/A	2019	\$7,500	\$8,112	\$ 8,112											
0070 - 2001 Featherite Trailer	Public V	2001	\$2,500	20 N/A	2021	\$4,500	\$4,867	\$ 4,867											
0071 - 2009 Featherite Trailer	Public V	2009	\$3,343	20 N/A	2029	\$4,500	\$5,475					\$ 5,475							
0072 - 2016 IP Manufacturing Roll Off Trailer	Public V	2016	\$2,500	20 N/A	2036	\$3,000	\$4,803												
0073 - 2009 Cart Away Water Trailer	Public V	2009	\$5,000	20 N/A	2029	\$6,500	\$7,908					\$ 7,908							
0080 CAT XQ60BM Standby Generator	Public V	2020	\$80,000	20 18 hrs	2040	\$0	\$0												
0083 - 1996 Airman Air Compressor Trailer	Public V	1996	\$9,500	20 815.9 Hrs.	2016	\$16,500	\$17,846	\$ 17,846											
0087 - 2002 John Deere 310E Backhoe	Public V	2002	\$39,900	20 5368.3 Hrs	2022	\$85,000	\$91,936	\$ 91,936											
0088 - 2002 Case 570 XLT Loader/Grader	Public V	2002	\$36,980	20 861.9 Hrs.	2022	\$0	\$0	\$ -											
0089 - 2015 John Deere 310L Backhoe	Public V	2015	\$93,477	20 1469.7 Hrs	2035	\$160,000	\$246,313												
0095 - 2009 International Vactor Truck Model 2103	Public V	2009	\$167,761	15 24,260	2024	\$347,000	\$375,315	\$ 375,315											
0097 - 2017 International Vactor Truck Model 2013	Public V	2017	\$287,000	15 9,496	2032	\$347,000	\$474,893										\$ 474,893		
<b>Public Works Equipment</b>						\$	\$	\$ 498,077	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 13,383					\$ 474,893		
<b>Public Works Grand Total</b>								\$ 498,077	\$ -	\$ -	\$ -	\$ 313,448	\$ 150,573	\$ 70,522	\$ 582,737				

Ultimately there are three questions:

1. **Is the assessment of our vehicle and maintenance plan a higher priority than accelerating an assessment of our water and sewer infrastructure?** Each is funded from different buckets that have funds, so the need to prioritize is simply staff time available to manage the projects.
2. **Is the cost of the project reasonable** given the work needed to complete the project
3. **Will the plan reduce our vehicle costs by \$18,900, making the project cost effective.**

ANSWERS:

1. Reviewing the current plan from the spreadsheets in last year's budget it is clear that the available funds in the existing vehicle replacement fund will cover nearly all of the immediate replacement needs for police and public works over the next 3-5 years. So this study is not critical.
2. Assuming Baker Tilly pays an analyst \$100/hour or \$208,000 a year salary and benefits. \$18,900 can pay for 189 hours of work. Between police and public works, we only have a total of 32 vehicles. They could spend up to six hours studying each vehicle. There is an argument that the money and time would be better spent on doing annual maintenance on the vehicles instead of studying them.
3. The plan seems unlikely to reduce operational costs by any significant margin. The city spends only about \$75,000 per year on fuel. If you can get 10c a gallon discount you might save \$1500 per year from a fuel procurement plan. If you have to drive to Santa

Rosa to get the discounted fuel the cost of fuel and wear and tear would limit any potential savings. A maintenance plan sounds great but is not terribly difficult. Modern vehicles don't have ignition parts that get replaced every 10,000 miles. Based on mileage most of the vehicles in the city would not reach oil change mileage limits more than once or twice a year. Few vehicles will need tire replacements during their lifetime. **A schedule of annual or biannual oil changes and transmission fluid every 5 years is pretty much the extent of the maintenance plan.**

The Baker Tilly proposal is professional and sounds great. **In reality for a small town few if any of the deliverables will move the needle to make us more efficient.** It is a nice to do activity, however given our financial crisis and limited staff time and no really critical issues with replacing vehicles as necessary for the next three to five years **it seems like prioritizing a water and sewer infrastructure study would serve the taxpayers better.**