Protecting Heritage trees in Sebastopol is an Objective standard.

We would like to update the City Council on the five Heritage Oaks #53, #54, #55, #56 & #57 on our property. The developer Pacific Properties intends to put 5'high & 9'high retaining walls far too close to our Oak trees. They will be severing large and small roots and the roots will be irreparably damaged. The building of & installing retaining walls proposed by the builder will also not be able to be done without breaking overhanging limbs that reach beyond the retaining wall, further damaging the trees. Know that for the health of our trees they were pruned by a professional licensed arborist in 2019.

Our trees #53, #54 & #56 & #57 will definitely not survive. The largest #56 & #57 are over 50' high.

# Following is our letter to the Design Review/Tree Board for the Nov. 19, 2020 meeting

(Regarding Woodmark Housing Development Pacific West - Eagle, ID)

'We have reviewed the original Tree Summary of the proposed Woodmark project submitted by John Messerve on Oct. 8, 2019 and the two Revised Tree Summaries of the proposed Woodmark project submitted by him on June 4, 2020 and Aug. 19, 2020 with understandable alarm.

In 2020 we thought the condition of the trees had not considerably changed in the 8-10 months. However, Meserve's assessment changed dramatically. Neighboring property trees to Woodmark that Messerve wrote needed to be removed in 2019 now magically could be saved. The trees all became 'healthier'. Trees that were never inspected by Messerve (#58 & 59) could be 'wrapped' and others that couldn't be 'wrapped' could. We are most familiar with the 9 Heritage trees on our and our immediate neighbors properties, nos. #52-#59.

Following is some of the Tree Boards discussion with Caleb Roope President Pacific West Properties and John Messerve Pacific West's arborist & Eric Chase (we believe) engineer

# Meeting: Sebastopol Design Review and Tree Board Nov. 19, 2020

## Cary Bush, Board Member

What is the life expectancy of a soldier pile wall like we have seen here? Is there an expected longevity date that this wall should remain structurally viable?

# Caleb Roope (Applicant)

It is a standard wall design that is been used all over. I am not really putting a timeline on it; I am not sure how you would. That is not an easy question to address. It is just a standard wall construction; I imagine it would be there for the life of the project.

## **Cary Bush**

Well, would a wood wall last the life of a project?

## **Caleb Roope**

The wood is treated so it will last.

# Eric Chase

Probably, somewhere around that. A 22- to 24-foot-long wide flange will get dropped in. Yes, you drop a wide flange and pour the concrete around it up to the top of the pier.

## Christine Level, Board Member

Right, I understand that. If you are going to be starting out with a 22- or 24-foot piece of steel that you are going to have to drop straight down into the hole. We are going to have these tree canopies coming over there, how are you going to address that issue because you are going to have to come across, they are going to have to be completely vertical, when they drop down into the hole, right? You need vertical clearance of at least the length of the piece of steel. If I am understanding correctly, you are going to have to come in with a crane to lift that sucker up, he is going to have to be 22 to 24 feet above the existing unexcavated grade to drop it down into that hole. I am wondering how we are planning to address the tree canopies that are all kind of cascading over that. There is a lot of concern from the public about the trees.

## **Caleb Roope**

We are also a general contractor. We have done this procedure (dropping soldier piles) probably no less than 30 or 40 times.

### John Meserve (Applicant Arborist)

Let me add from the arborist perspective. I have worked on a number of projects, same thing, there might need to be some very selective pruning here and there to create that access, but it is totally doable just the way Mr. Roope described.

## **Christine Level**

We are going to have to be using the ground contact pressure treatment for this, correct?

### Eric Chase

I would assume we are going to be dealing with it being in contact with the ground. Yes.

### **Christine Level**

I am wondering about the toxicity level of the pressure treated when you have got that much of it exposed going around with this retaining wall. I am just putting that on the table because that stuff is very toxic.

### **Caleb Roope**

That often depends on how you treat it. There are means and methods and codes that we have to follow. You cannot just drop arsenic treated board in the ground. We can bring experts in to talk about that, but this is kind of a standard construction methodology that happens all over the country all the time to deal with the very kinds of conditions that we have here.

### Cary Bush

I have a question for Mr. Meserve. Trees have been a big topic on the project itself. Can we hear a general assessment on trees number 52, 53, 54, 56, and 57? Is there any kind of general assessment you can give us regarding existing conditions and possible proposed construction impact?

### John Meserve

Sure. Those are all trees in good condition. I did not find any significant distress or decline. They are vital trees for the for the most part. We are encroaching some on some drip lines and I am sure that is going to be a topic here before we are done. I think the amount of encroachment is reasonable. I have said in some of my documentation that you might have read, on the two big trees, 56 and 57, I am calling that a moderate impact, I do not want to downplay the fact or try to convince you that There is going to be no impact, because there will be some impact. But that impact will be moderate, and moderate is very acceptable on large, healthy, vital trees, I fully

expect those trees to survive, and to not have a problem..... I can address any specific questions the Board may have.

## **Cary Bush**

That is fantastic. Just curious to hear your thoughts overall. Trees 56 and 57 are significant landmarks. We are just trying to minimize any impact because it does not belong to the applicant, it belongs to the neighbors. We are just trying to understand how that soldier pile wall and/or retaining wall would impact the trees. No one ever knows, once you start digging, but what we may expect based on what you have experienced throughout your career and how this relates to the real world.

## John Meserve

I love the soldier pile wall; I think that is the best choice there is short of not putting a wall in at all.....In terms of my comments about moderate, I think it is important to consider what trees go through in their lives......if they are healthy to start with, which we for the most part have very healthy trees, they are very capable of tolerating a little bit of root loss, just like they tolerate canopy and foliage loss when we go through and prune a canopy. There really is not a lot of difference. Roots regrow, just like branches regrow. The critical part here is that we do not take too much canopy when we are pruning and damage the tree. It is also critical that we do not take too much root system when we are excavating and damage the tree. I think we are in the category of yes, there will be some impact, but the trees should respond just fine.

Lavine note: the largest Oak tree #57 became in Mr. Meserve's opinion 'healthier' from 2019 to 2020 when he said it was 'moderately' healthy and needed to be removed.

### Kari Svanstrom, Planning Director

Chair, if the Board does not, I do have one that is sort of the junction between the trees and retaining walls that is a little bit of a question. It is from my own experience monitoring a number of construction projects, I know there are rules of thumb about how many larger roots you can cut and still have a tree be viable. I do not know if this is for the civil engineer, or for the arborist, or both. What happens if, as you are excavating down, you get fourth or fifth board down, and you find a number of significant roots, what happens to the project at that point?

### John Meserve

I will jump in there with my opinion and my experience. We prune those roots properly, and roots that are pruned properly respond just like a branch that is pruned properly. You have all seen a branch that is cut, and then it resprouts all around it. A root does the same thing if it is cleanly cut. Where that happens, if they are cleanly cut, we would expect those to resprout and regenerate. The moderate impact I am talking about is not a permanent, moderate impact. It is a temporary, moderate impact, allowing those roots to regrow, respond, and regenerate themselves. Lavine note: the roots will be cut and exposed to and sitting next to arsenic treated wood. Not only will roots not 'resprout' more roots will die back.

-----



